



The Public-Private Consultations (PPC) for FTA Negotiations in Canada and Indonesia

JESSICA CALLISTA

Jakarta, 28 February 2018

Canada

Program undertaken with the financial support of the Government of Canada provided through Global Affairs Canada

Project Executed by:



The Conference Board
of Canada

Partner:



Outline

1

Introduction

- Objectives
- Methodologies
- The Importance of PPC for Indonesia

2

Consultation

- PPC definition
- Indonesia
 - Current implementation
 - Weaknesses
- Canada
 - PPC current implementation
 - Challenges
 - Strengths

3

Position Paper

- Collecting opinions
- Choosing stances

4

Conclusion and Recommendations

- PPC
- Position paper



1

Introduction



Introduction

Objectives

- Providing a comprehensive description of PPC mechanism in Canada and summarizing the best practices;
- Formulating recommendations to establish a strong PPC mechanism in Indonesia;
- Identifying the best practices on how to prepare trade negotiating position papers; and
- Outlining different approaches of consultations by the government and the private sector, and to balance conflicting inputs.

Methodologies

- Conducting meetings and/or interviews to gather intelligence from primary sources;
- Using desk research to collect information; and
- Discussing the issues and reports with the CBoC colleagues.



Introduction

The Importance of PPC for Indonesia

As of January 2018, 6 on-going FTAs negotiations and 12 upcoming

Limited PPC

Current and future FTAs?

On-going Negotiations

1. Indonesia – EU CEPA
2. Indonesia – Australia CEPA
3. Indonesia – EFTA CEPA
4. Indonesia – Iran PTA
5. Indonesia – Turkey CEPA
6. RCEP

Implemented & On Review

1. Indonesia – Japan EPA
2. Indonesia – Pakistan PTA
3. AEC, AANZFTA, AIFTA

Upcoming Negotiations

1. Indonesia – Bangladesh PTA
2. Indonesia – Sri Lanka PTA
3. Indonesia – Taiwan ECA
4. Indonesia – GCC PTA
5. Indonesia – Kenya PTA
6. Indonesia – Morocco PTA
7. Indonesia – Mozambique PTA
8. Indonesia – Nigeria PTA
9. Indonesia – SACU PTA
10. Indonesia – EAEU
11. Indonesia – Peru
12. ASEAN – Canada FTA

Benefits?

FTAs are conducted to **benefit** the parties. PPC plays an important role to connect government and private sector, so that business views are well conveyed during the negotiation process.



2

FTA Negotiation Consultation Mechanisms in Indonesia and Canada



PPC: Definition and Objectives

Definition

Based on research and meetings conducted in Canada, PPC in the context of FTA negotiations is:

a two-way consultation between the government and private sector on FTA negotiations and implementation that is conducted in a transparent, systematic, and continuous way through a variety of instruments.



PPC: Definition and Objectives

Objectives

- Build trust and strong relationships and establish a mutual understanding between the government and private sector;
- disseminate and collect related information accurately and in a timely manner;
- obtain the views of the private sector and other key stakeholders;
- identify offensive and defensive interests from the private sector and other stakeholders;
- formulate solid positions for FTA negotiations to benefit the whole country.

Benefit
for
the
country



Indonesia

Current Implementation of FTA Consultations

Lead negotiator:
Ministry of Trade

**Government
of
Indonesia**

Meetings,
discussions, events
(seminar, workshop)

**Indonesian
Private
Sector**

- KADIN Indonesia, APINDO, and certain business leaders
- Gathering members' views, preparing position papers



Canada



Indonesia

Weaknesses

1

Low awareness on FTAs

- Most Indonesian private sector (particularly SMEs) are not well aware of the FTA negotiations that Indonesia has completed or is currently conducting;
- Low awareness of FTAs leads to poor knowledge in FTA issues and passive involvement from the Indonesian private sector.

2

Lack of transparency

- The private sector finds it difficult to obtain timely information on each FTA negotiation round and current FTA implementation.

3

Limited number of views received and little access for the general public

- During the consultation, views received are limited to certain private sector (business associations and companies);
- The broader topics encompassed in newer FTAs indicate that PPC should reach out to the general public as well (including non-business stakeholders), which is not the case in Indonesia.



Indonesia

Weaknesses

4

Lack of follow-up information and continuous consultation mechanism

- The private sector finds it difficult to follow up on the views that have been conveyed to the Government of Indonesia. In addition, consultations should be conducted before, during, and after each FTA negotiation round.
-

5

Limited access to negotiators

- The Indonesian private sector (especially SME) has limited access to the Government of Indonesia for direct consultations.
-



Canada

History and Evolution

WTO and CUSFTA

- PPC has been implemented since the Uruguay Round and FTA negotiations with the US;
- The WTO and CUSFTA negotiations have also shaping Canada's trade policy and consultation process.



SAGIT

- Sectoral Advisory Group on International Trade, a formal mechanism among government institutions;
- Confidential, selected members (business, NGOs, labor union, academia);
- Provide advice.



3 Cs

- **Coordination:** between the 3 level of government
- **Consultation:** between the government and private sector
- **Communication:** general public



Inclusive

- FTAs have gone beyond the traditional issues and included many new issues (e-commerce, environment, labor, gender, government procurement, more);
- Non-business stakeholders.



Canada

PPC Instruments

1

Canada Gazette

- Official magazine (newspaper) of the Government of Canada which started its publication in 1841, contains formal public notices, official appointments, proposed regulations, and more information;
 - However these days, not many people in the general public read the Canada Gazette;
 - Through the GAC Consultation Portal, Government of Canada provides a list of links to consultation activities and related information;
 - Some private sector associations are proactive and use Canada Gazette to obtain necessary information on FTAs and make online submissions of their views in the forms of reports and/or position papers.
-

2

Global Affairs Canada Website

- 2 status of PPC in Canada: (1) active and ongoing, and (2) closed/completed;
 - GAC invites interested parties (both business stakeholders and other stakeholders) to submit their written submissions by email or by mailing those views to the provided address of GAC.
-



Canada

PPC Instruments

3

Other electronic means

- Website, e-mail, online consultation, survey/questionnaire, and social media;
- Although not considered as an official one, the Government of Canada finds it quite efficient and effective in gathering various views;
- In today's global world, electronic means are easy to use as they offer flexibility and faster and cost-effective communications on trade negotiations. Similar to Canada Gazette, the private sector often uses the electronic tools to submit their views.

4

Meetings and conference calls

- Tend to take place on an ad-hoc basis;
- The Government of Canada make themselves available to the Canadian private sector, and Canadian private sector finds these meetings and conference calls productive and efficient, particularly when they need to obtain information on an urgent basis for their business.



Canada

PPC Instruments

5

Open and two-way consultations

- Open consultations (such as seminars and public town-hall meetings) are initiated and organized by the Government of Canada and Canadian private sector, respectively;
- The Government of Canada would initiate such open consultations to provide opportunities for all interested Canadians to convey their views;
- Canadian private sector also invited government officials as speakers in their related events to disseminate FTA information and provide further explanations.



Canada

Status of PPC

Open PPC

- Currently active PPC on on-going FTA negotiations;
- Meetings and conference calls, open consultations, and those PPC implemented out via electronic means;
- Depending on the issues and urgencies, PPC might be carried out monthly. Certain FTAs that are considered to be of high importance (TPP and NAFTA renegotiations) are conducted on a more frequent basis.

Closed PPC

- PPC that have exceeded certain period of time, depending on the FTAs;
- Important for future development.

Participants

- Business stakeholders
- Non-business stakeholders
- Individuals
- Experts/academics
- Civil society organizations and NGOs
- Labour unions
- Indigenous peoples
- Students and youth
- Any other interested Canadian stakeholders



Canada

Main Challenges in PPC Implementation and How to Tackle Them

Main Challenges

Government of Canada

Canadian Private Sector

Contradicting views

- Listening to all views is a must;
- Carefully filter those views to sum up the points for the well-being of the Canadian economy as a whole.

- Two different approaches:
 - A majority would gather different views and present a report;
 - Some would only adopt the majority views.

Limited knowledge of on-going FTA negotiations

- Make all related information available on their websites and open to any queries;
- Organize events (open consultations), seminars, one-on-one meetings, conference calls, and other activities.

- Provide members with regular updates, briefs, and memos.
- Organize events (seminars, roundtables) and invite government officials as speakers to communicate with and educate their members.



Canada

PPC Key Strengths

1

Flexibility

- The absence of law on PPC does not have major negative impact on PPC implementation. In fact, it offers more flexibility in conducting necessary PPC based on the needs and priorities of each FTA. Flexibility **maintains the momentum of PPC and enables faster consultation** between government and the private sector without going through unnecessary procedures.

2

Accurate and timely dissemination of information

- The government and private sector reach out to each other prior to, during, and after FTA negotiations to ensure **accurate and timely information is received by each party.**

3

Transparency

- The implementation of PPC upholds transparency as most of the information and position papers are made publicly available;
- The Government of Canada ensures that the private sector and other stakeholders have **access to all related information on FTAs in a timely manner.**



Canada

PPC Key Strengths

4

Access to all parties

- Both the Government and private sector make themselves available for consultations, hence, **input from the private sector is conveyed directly to the government and trade-related information is also received directly by the private sector.**

5

Communication process

- Supported by its flexibility, transparency, and access to the government, PPC in Canada has established **smooth communication** between the government and the private sector as well as between business associations and their members.

6

Inclusivity

- The Government of Canada also listens to non-business stakeholders for broader information. **Inclusivity enriches the input received by the government in preparing for FTA negotiations.**



3

Canadian Private Sector: Position Papers on FTA Negotiations



Position Papers

Collecting Opinions from Members

Disseminating background information

- Summarize the information into a brief or memo and disseminated via email to its members;
- Conduct dissemination of information on a regular basis;
- Organize events to specifically increase their members' knowledge in FTA;
- For technical issues, request assistance from members with certain expertise (particularly legal).

Brainstorming session

- Some Canadian business associations would also conduct meetings with different committees within their own associations for brainstorming and sharing of information with different committees to improve the knowledge of their associations as a whole.

Meetings and calls

- Direct consultations with their members through conference calls and meetings. They would also consult through electronic means, in particular e-mails;
- Although there is no formal procedure, Canadian business associations reach out to their members frequently (daily, weekly, monthly, ad-hoc).

Online survey

- conduct online surveys and disseminate questionnaires to their members to understand their positions better and to obtain feedbacks on certain negotiating issues.



Position Papers

Choosing Stances from the Opinions Received

1 Summarizing all views

- Carefully summarize all views (both supporting and opposing);
- Provide all views to the Government for consideration in identifying key interests of Canadian businesses for FTA negotiations.

2 Adopting majority views

- Some Canadian business institutions would prefer to only present majority views of their members to voice their business interests (credibility);
- Members with opposing views are encouraged to convey their views to the Government of Canada through other PPC instruments.

Opinions must be evidence-based



4

Conclusion & Recommendations



Conclusion

Although PPC in Canada is not (yet) formalized by laws/regulations, both government and private sector have shown their interests and commitments to always reach out to each other on certain issues for FTA negotiations and implementation. The Government of Canada and Canadian private sector have established various PPC instruments, so the private sector can freely convey its views. In addition, the Government of Canada also invites non-business stakeholders in the consultation process of FTA negotiations.

From the Canadian private sector's perspective, the PPC mechanism has been an effective advocacy tool, and the inclusive approach taken by the Government of Canada is seen as an opportunity to increase transparency and address the legitimate concerns from non-business stakeholders.

On the other hand, PPC for FTA negotiations in Indonesia is limited to certain extent (meetings, discussions, events), and the practices of PPC in Canada, especially the implemented PPC instruments, can serve as a guidance to boost and improve Indonesia's current PPC.



Recommendations

For PPC

1

Establish a single-window, user-friendly web portal for PPC in Indonesia

- The portal should operate in a similar way as Canada Gazette and/or GAC website, run and managed by the Government of Indonesia (in this case, the Ministry of Trade as the lead negotiator for Indonesia). The Government of Indonesia should publish related FTA information that is not confidential, structured in a concise way and in simple terms to ensure complete understanding of the Indonesian private sector and other stakeholders.
- The portal should be transparent, consistent, reliable, and accessible.
- The portal should provide the Indonesian private sector and other stakeholders with opportunities to give comments on all information, as well as to submit their views in the form of submissions or position papers.



Recommendations

For PPC

2

Establish a committee to monitor the PPC

- The committee should be led by the Government of Indonesia, and its members should include Indonesian private sector and other key stakeholders (experts, academia, NGO, other).
- The main job of the committee is to monitor the PPC implementation. It should ensure that all information is provided and updated accordingly, and that the Indonesian private sector and other stakeholders have full access and opportunities to submit their views.
- The committee is also responsible for the follow-ups of PPC, ensuring that the Indonesian private sector and other stakeholders are consulted well and all their views are captured by the Government of Indonesia.



Recommendations

For PPC

3

Produce a template form for inputs/contributions

- The Government of Indonesia should produce a template form for the Indonesian private sector and other stakeholders as a guide in submitting their views. The form should be made available for download on its website.
- The main objective of producing a template form is to guide the Indonesian private sector and other stakeholders in conveying important issues (with highlights, details, justifications/evidences, and other necessary aspects), so that the Government of Indonesia can obtain accurate inputs for FTA negotiations.



Recommendations

For PPC

4

Produce briefing notes prior to PPC

- The Government of Indonesia should produce briefing notes and make them available online for the Indonesian private sector and other stakeholders prior to conducting PPC on certain negotiating issues.
- For internal consultations, business associations should also produce briefing notes and disseminate them to their members prior to conducting internal consultations on FTA negotiations.



Recommendations

For PPC

5

Organize regular capacity building activities

- Facilitators with extensive and related experience and knowledge in PPC should be invited to contribute to the capacity building efforts.
- The main objectives of these activities are:
 - To develop technical assistance capacity in PPC implementation;
 - To support both the government and private sector in dealing with the issues in the implementation of PPC;
 - To provide updated information on PPC implementation (if any).



Recommendations

For PPC

6

Conduct regular meetings

- Regular meetings are proven to be effective in building mutual trust and understanding. That way, both the Government and the private sector can understand each other better and strengthen their relationships.
- The committee should be in charge of the scheduling of such meetings.



Recommendations

For Position Papers (Business Association)

1

More proactive

- Business associations and their members should proactively reach out to one another on a regular basis, especially when there are issues on certain topics that need to be communicated in the FTA negotiation process.

2

Two-way exchange of information

- Association has to be aware of new information, in which members play an important role to also inform the association;
- Information has to be disseminated on a regular basis (every 1 or 2 weeks).

3

Brainstorming with different committees

- To improve the knowledge of their associations as a whole.



Recommendations

For Position Paper (Business Association)

4

Engaging members with certain expertise or partnering with external experts

- Position papers have to be supported with solid justifications. For technical matters, members with certain expertise must be engaged well. Partnering with external experts would also help.

5

Summarize all views

- With many industry sectors and various business interests, the Indonesian private sector must provide all views to the Government for their consideration in FTA negotiations and negotiations.



Thank you for your attention

Comments/suggestions are welcome



Special thanks to:

- | | | | | | |
|---|--|---|----|--|---|
| 1 | Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada | Mr. Denis Landreville, <i>Director/Lead Negotiator, Regional Agreements, Trade Negotiations Division</i>
Mr. Alessandro Longo, <i>Trade Policy Analyst, Canada – EU Negotiations, Trade Negotiations Division</i>
Ms. Jasmine Labelle | 8 | Canada China Business Council | Ms. Sarah Kutulakos, <i>Executive Director and COO</i> |
| 2 | Global Affairs Canada | Mr. Gary Lee, <i>Deputy Director, Trade Policy and Negotiations Division, Asia</i> | 9 | Finance Department of Canada | Ms. Anna Kwik, <i>Chief, General Trade Relations</i>
Mr. Scott Winter, <i>Senior International Trade Relations Officer</i> |
| 3 | Business Council of Canada | Mr. Brian Kingston, <i>Vice President, Policy, International and Fiscal</i> | 10 | The Canadian Chamber of Commerce | Ms. Adriana Vega, <i>Director, International Policy</i>
Ms. Susanna Cluff-Clyburne, <i>Director, Parliamentary Affairs</i> |
| 4 | Canadian Association of Importers and Exporters | Ms. Joy Nott, <i>President and CEO</i>
Mr. James Sutton, <i>Director for Advocacy</i> | 11 | Montreal International | Mr. Christian Bernard, <i>Chief Economist and Vice President Marketing Communication</i> |
| 5 | Canadian Manufacturers and Exporters | Mr. Mathew Wilson, <i>Senior Vice President</i> | 12 | Quebec Federation of Chamber of Commerce | Mr. Pierre-Yves Boivin, <i>Vice President, Strategy and Economic Affairs</i>
Ms. Marie-Josée Côté, <i>Advisor, Strategy and Economic Affairs</i> |
| 6 | Munk School of Global Affairs | Prof. Mark S. Manger, <i>Associate Professor of Political Economy and Global Affairs</i> | 13 | Quebec International | Ms. Melanie Abdel-Malak, <i>Director - International Affairs</i> |
| 7 | Ontario Ministry of International Trade | Ms. Victoria Clark
Ms. Jenarra De Souza, <i>Manager</i> | 14 | Ministry of International Relations of Quebec | Mr. Mathieu Parenteau, <i>Desk officer – India, Central, South and Southeast Asia</i>
Mr. Jessie L. Malone, <i>Desk advisor – India, Central, South and Southeast Asia</i> |
| | | | 15 | The Asia Pacific Foundation | Mr. Justin Elavathil, <i>Program Manager, Trade, Investment, and Innovation</i>
Ms. Yushu Zhu, <i>Program Manager, Surveys and Polling</i>
Ms. Pauline Stern, <i>Project Specialist, Trade and Investment</i> |
| | | | 16 | Montreal Metropolitan Chamber of Commerce | Mr. Charles Letourneau, <i>Director, Strategy and Communications</i>
Ms. Erandi Motte Cortes, <i>Director, Market and Entrepreneurship Development</i> |

